

More evidence for non-maternal inheritance of mitochondrial DNA?

H-J Bandelt, Q-P Kong, W Parson, A Salas



J Med Genet 2005;42:957–960. doi: 10.1136/jmg.2005.033589

Background: A single case of paternal co-transmission of mitochondrial DNA (mtDNA) in humans has been reported so far.

Objective: To find potential instances of non-maternal inheritance of mtDNA.

Methods: Published medical case studies (of single patients) were searched for irregular mtDNA patterns by comparing the given haplotype information for different clones or tissues with the worldwide mtDNA database as known to date—a method that has proved robust and reliable for the detection of flawed mtDNA sequence data.

Results: More than 20 studies were found reporting clear cut instances with mtDNAs of different ancestries in single individuals. As examples, cases are reviewed from recent published reports which, at face value, may be taken as evidence for paternal inheritance of mtDNA or recombination.

Conclusions: Multiple types (or recombinant types) of quite dissimilar mitochondrial DNA from different parts of the known mtDNA phylogeny are often reported in single individuals. From re-analyses and corrigenda of forensic mtDNA data, it is apparent that the phenomenon of mixed or mosaic mtDNA can be ascribed solely to contamination and sample mix up.

In the past few years some exciting claims have been made about the mode of inheritance of mtDNA as well as the role of mtDNA in the pathogenesis of several human diseases. However, early attempts to show that mtDNA could undergo recombination in populations were based on misread^{1,2} or flawed data and unjustified premises about the mutational process,^{3,4} or biased data collection, inadequate and misapplied statistics, and technical and logical errors.^{5–9} The observation that paternally inherited mtDNA was present in the muscle tissues of a Danish patient suffering from a mitochondrial myopathy¹⁰ is most remarkable but appears at present to be an isolated phenomenon, and has neither been confirmed in another laboratory nor found in other cases of sporadic myopathies.^{11–13} Most recently,¹⁴ it was reported that mtDNA recombination in singular muscle tissue had been demonstrated in vivo in the Danish myopathy patient.¹⁰ One way of searching for further potential instances of abnormal inheritance of mtDNA is to explore the rich medical genetics literature, where mtDNA information is generated on a case by case basis and recorded mutation by mutation—though sadly without taking the emerging mtDNA phylogeny into account.¹⁵

METHODS

In our examination we employed in principle all mtDNA sequences published so far (>2000 coding region sequences

and >30 000 partial control region sequences). The complete sequences can be hierarchically organised in a worldwide mtDNA phylogeny, the major branches (clades) of which are referred to as haplogroups, encoded in a hierarchical manner.^{16–20}

RESULTS

Paternal mtDNA in Klinefelter's syndrome?

A case of abnormal mtDNA inheritance, which has apparently not attracted much attention in the scientific community, was reported in cases of Klinefelter's syndrome,²¹ where a possible interaction of the sex chromosome and mtDNA was hypothesised. In that study, mtDNA was analysed in eight Klinefelter males, seven from the USA and one from Japan, for the variation in the first hypervariable segment (HVS-I) and the second hypervariable segment (HVS-II) of the mtDNA control region. Most astonishingly, all seven American samples turned out to have identical HVS-I and HVS-II sequences outside the long C stretches (which is highly improbable for unrelated African American individuals) and even shared the same two heteroplasmies (table 1, No 1). Puzzlingly, the Japanese Klinefelter individual (table 1, No 2) had almost the same array of mutations, but his mother (table 1, No 3) showed a number of different mutations, especially in HVS-II.

Note that the rCRS²² nucleotide at position 223 was reported incorrectly as G (instead of T) and the “number of polymorphism” for the “normal Japanese” sample (of size 60) was inverted for most positions in HVS-II.²¹ The high level of polymorphism (34/60) for position 227 is most implausible in view of the corresponding value (1/373) in two sets of Japanese data.^{23,24} In any case, most of the nucleotide positions listed in table 1 were also claimed to be polymorphic (to various degrees) in the “normal Japanese”.²¹ This is extraordinary in that, besides position 227, only position 263 has been found to be polymorphic in published Japanese data. Also worldwide, most of those positions are extremely conservative. In fact, the 10 positions 16060, 16089, 16208, 16384, 80, 120, 126, 223, 254, and 299 were all found unvaried in the MITOMAP (<http://www.mitomap.org/>) and SWGDAM (<http://www.fbi.gov/hq/lab/fsc/backissu/april2002/miller1.htm>) databases, except for one incorrectly recorded entry (16089) in MITOMAP, whereas 16042, 227, and 263 are known to be polymorphic to a very minor degree. In the Klinefelter data,²¹ the latter three positions solely show transitions but the former 10 positions all show transversions (table 1).

Some of these unexpected variants can be attributed to misinterpretation of the sequence electropherograms, which were generated using the ABI PRISM dye terminator cycle

Abbreviations: HVS-I, first hypervariable segment; HVS-II, second hypervariable segment; mtDNA, mitochondrial DNA; rCRS, revised Cambridge reference sequence

mtDNA and other CD34⁺ clones. Thus the aggregate sequence and the deviant sequence harbour the motifs of two distinct Indian subhaplogroups of haplogroup M (A73G T146C T195A A263G T489C 522-523del 16166del C16223T T16519C versus A73G A153G A263G C463T T485C T489C C16223T; authors' unpublished data). Although it was contended that "to prevent DNA cross-contamination, special precautions were taken",³² it seems that these "precautions" were not sufficient. Two step nested polymerase chain reaction (PCR), as applied in these cases, bears an increased risk of allowing contaminant mtDNA to enter the process.

A study of mtDNA control region mutations in patients with oesophageal squamous cell carcinoma³⁵ offers an interesting case of apparent recombinant mtDNA. The mtDNA found in the tumour sample of case 20 (C16185T C16223T C16260T T16298C) clearly indicates that this is an East Asian haplogroup Z sequence,¹⁶ whereas the blood sample (C16256T C16270T A16399G) points to the European haplogroup U5a1.^{19, 20} In contrast, no single discriminating mutation was recorded for HVS-II, despite the fact that the HVS-II mutation motif T152C 249d T489C would clearly separate those two haplogroups. Thus we infer that either the blood mtDNA or the tumour mtDNA must constitute a recombinant type. The reported data³⁵ contain yet another case of totally different mtDNA lineages in one patient, and there are plenty of further cases from cancer research where mixed or recombinant mtDNA samples in single patients can be inferred in the same way as outlined above.

In summary, previous screening of mtDNA data from evolutionary and forensic studies has provided a rich record of obviously flawed or doubtful results that would directly affect the question of whether mtDNA may occasionally be inherited non-maternally. Clear cut artificial recombinants between separately amplified segments can easily be detected through focused database searches and phylogenetic analysis.³⁶ For instance, the SWGDAM database—a forensic mtDNA database that went online in 2002—contained at least six obvious instances of artificial recombination,^{36, 37} only four of which have been corrected so far through two partial revisions of the database for transcription errors.^{38, 39} This could indicate that some recombinants had been generated in the laboratory through sample mix up or contamination and are therefore unrecognisable by mere re-reading of sequencer outputs. The German database "D-Loop-BASE" (<http://www.d-loop-base.de/>) suffered from massive artificial recombination and all kinds of other problems,⁴⁰ so that it eventually had to go offline in early 2004.

Have we really discovered new cases of non-maternal inheritance of mtDNA? The Klinefelter case²¹ can be dismissed as the result of an obvious sequencing disaster. The other instances^{28, 32, 34} discussed above indeed point to different sources of the mtDNAs that were attributed to single patients. In one cancer patient,³⁵ one compound haplotype is even composed from HVS-I and HVS-II stemming from different mtDNAs. To explain these findings, however, one does not have to invoke novel mechanisms of mtDNA inheritance. The lesson learnt from forensic mtDNA databases offers a much more straightforward explanation—namely, the mechanism of laboratory artefacts.

The recent study¹⁴ about seeming recombination of mtDNA in the Danish patient should give researchers a hint that recombination needs to be considered as a potential factor in their studies—but then *artificial* recombination should come to mind first. Among other questionable aspects of that study,¹⁴ we observe that the methodological approach employed (single molecule PCR) is in fact extremely prone to contamination (owing to the minimal amounts of DNA that were used); moreover, the highly statistically significant

mtDNA recombination hotspots B and C bound familiar mtDNA segments generated with standard primer pairs (as applied in human population genetics). Therefore, there is room here for much scepticism.

The cohorts of published artefacts in forensic databases^{27, 36, 37, 40, 41} suggest that the most natural reason for seeing totally different mtDNAs or mosaic compound haplotypes in a single individual is casual handling and mis-sequencing of samples in the laboratory. It seems that the chances for artificial recombination and the possibility of other systematic errors in mtDNA analyses are notoriously underestimated. With solid complete sequencing studies, there is increasing evidence that there is absolutely no sign of natural recombination.^{7, 29} For example, the HVS-I and HVS-II status was a good predictor of the coding region variation in cases of frequent HVS-I and HVS-II haplotypes, notwithstanding occasional single recurrent mutations in HVS-I and HVS-II.⁴² On the other hand, poor laboratory work executed on large parts of the coding region yielded very clear signals of artefacts.^{43, 44} In summary, the point is that the mtDNA phylogeny mirrors the population history during thousands of years, a period that should be long enough to generate a signal of recombination, if any is present. Any population harbours phylogenetically distant mtDNA haplotypes, so that there is in general about a 50% chance of having such distant mtDNAs involved in a recombination event—whether real or not. It is then evident that the frivolous statement "recombination is difficult to detect in population genetic data, even if it is occurring at appreciable frequencies"⁴⁵ is plainly wrong.

It has been said that "special claims require special evidence".⁴⁶ Non-maternal inheritance of mtDNA would certainly be very special. This means that for every result that called the dogma of maternal inheritance of mtDNA into question one would need independent extraction, amplification, and sequencing in another laboratory—in analogy to the situation with ancient DNA, where independent replication is required.⁴⁷ This clearly holds for all cases of (seeming) paternal inheritance or blocks of multiple somatic mutations in patients. We agree that "systematic haplotype analyses of large cohorts of patients with sporadic mtDNA mutations and healthy individuals are therefore warranted to unravel this enigma".⁴⁸ However, it appears to be even more important to unravel the causes of laboratory artefacts that might lead to premature claims of mitochondrial association with certain diseases⁴⁹ or of sporadic non-maternal inheritance of mtDNA. Any attempt to propose recombination of mtDNA in such cases should also explain why the worldwide mtDNA phylogeny faithfully mirrors the non-recombinant nature of this genome.

Authors' affiliations

H-J Bandelt, Fachbereich Mathematik, Universität Hamburg, Hamburg, Germany

Q-P Kong, Key Laboratory of Cellular and Molecular Evolution and Molecular Biology of Domestic Animals, Kunming Institute of Zoology, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Kunming, Yunnan, China

W Parson, Institute of Legal Medicine, Innsbruck Medical University, Innsbruck, Austria

A Salas, Unidad de Genética, Instituto de Medicina Legal, Facultad de Medicina, Santiago de Compostela, Galicia, Spain

Competing interests: none declared

Correspondence to: Dr Hans-Jürgen Bandelt, Fachbereich Mathematik, Universität Hamburg, Bundesstr 55, 20146 Hamburg, Germany; bandelt@math.uni-hamburg.de

Received 1 April 2005

Revised version received 15 May 2005

Accepted for publication 17 May 2005

Published Online First 27 May 2005

REFERENCES

- 1 Hagelberg E, Goldman N, Lio P, Whelan S, Schiefenhover W, Clegg JB, Bowden DK. Evidence for mitochondrial DNA recombination in a human population of island Melanesia. *Proc R Soc London Ser B Biol Sci* 1999;**266**:485–92.
- 2 Hagelberg E, Goldman N, Lio P, Whelan S, Schiefenhover W, Clegg JB, Bowden DK. Evidence for mitochondrial DNA recombination in a human population of island Melanesia: correction. *Proc R Soc London Ser B Biol Sci* 2000;**267**:1595–6.
- 3 Eyre-Walker A, Smith NH, Smith JM. How clonal are human mitochondria? *Proc R Soc London Ser B Biol Sci* 1999;**266**:477–83.
- 4 Macaulay V, Richards M, Sykes B. Mitochondrial DNA recombination – no need to panic. *Proc R Soc London Ser B Biol Sci* 1999;**266**:2037–9.
- 5 Awadalla P, Eyre-Walker A, Smith JM. Linkage disequilibrium and recombination in hominid mitochondrial DNA. *Science* 1999;**286**:2524–5.
- 6 Kivisild T, Vilems R. Questioning evidence for recombination in human mitochondrial DNA. *Science* 2000;**288**:1931a.
- 7 Elson JL, Andrews RM, Chinnery PF, Lightowlers RN, Turnbull DM, Howell N. Analysis of European mtDNAs for recombination. *Am J Hum Genet* 2001;**68**:145–53.
- 8 Piganeau G, Eyre-Walker A. A reanalysis of the indirect evidence for recombination in human mitochondrial DNA. *Heredity* 2004;**92**:282–8.
- 9 Hedrick P, Kumar S. Mutation and linkage disequilibrium in human mtDNA. *Eur J Hum Genet* 2001;**9**:969–72.
- 10 Schwartz M, Vissing J. Paternal inheritance of mitochondrial DNA. *N Engl J Med* 2002;**347**:576–80.
- 11 Filosto M, Mancuso M, Vives-Bauza C, Vila MR, Shanske S, Hirano M, Andreu AL, DiMauro S. Lack of paternal inheritance of muscle mitochondrial DNA in sporadic mitochondrial myopathies. *Ann Neurol* 2003;**54**:524–6.
- 12 Taylor RW, McDonnell MT, Blakely EL, Chinnery PF, Taylor GA, Howell N, Zeviani M, Briem E, Carrara F, Turnbull DM. Genotypes from patients indicate no paternal mitochondrial DNA contribution. *Ann Neurol* 2003;**54**:521–4.
- 13 Schwartz M, Vissing J. No evidence for paternal inheritance of mtDNA in patients with sporadic mtDNA mutations. *J Neurol Sci* 2004;**218**:99–101.
- 14 Kraysberg Y, Schwartz M, Brown TA, Ebraldise K, Kunz WS, Clayton DA, Vissing J, Khrapko K. Recombination of human mitochondrial DNA. *Science* 2004;**304**:981.
- 15 Herrnstadt C, Howell N. An evolutionary perspective on pathogenic mtDNA mutations: haplogroup associations of clinical disorders. *Mitochondrion* 2004;**4**:791–8.
- 16 Kong Q-P, Yao Y-G, Sun C, Bandelt H-J, Zhu C-L, Zhang Y-P. Phylogeny of East Asian mitochondrial DNA lineages inferred from complete sequences. *Am J Hum Genet* 2003;**73**:671–6; erratum, **75**:157.
- 17 Maca-Meyer N, Gonzalez AM, Pestano J, Flores C, Larruga JM, Cabrera VC. Mitochondrial DNA transit between West Asia and North Africa inferred from U6 phylogeography. *BMC Genetics* 2003;**4**:15.
- 18 Achilli A, Rengo C, Magri C, Battaglia V, Olivieri A, Scozzari R, Cruciani F, Zeviani M, Briem E, Carelli V, Moral P, Dugoujon JM, Roostalu U, Loogvali EL, Kivisild T, Bandelt HJ, Richards M, Vilems R, Santachiara-Benerecetti AS, Semino O, Torroni A. The molecular dissection of mtDNA haplogroup H confirms that the Franco-Cantabrian glacial refuge was a major source for the European gene pool. *Am J Hum Genet* 2004;**75**:910–18.
- 19 Achilli A, Rengo C, Battaglia V, Pala M, Olivieri A, Fornarino S, Magri C, Scozzari R, Babudri N, Santachiara-Benerecetti AS, Bandelt HJ, Semino O, Torroni A. Saami and Berbers – an unexpected mitochondrial DNA link. *Am J Hum Genet* 2005;**76**:883–6.
- 20 Palanichamy M, Sun C, Agrawal S, Bandelt HJ, Kong QP, Khan F, Wang CY, Chaudhuri TK, Palla V, Zhang YP. Phylogeny of mtDNA macrohaplogroup N in India based on complete sequencing: implications for the peopling of South Asia. *Am J Hum Genet* 2004;**75**:966–78.
- 21 Oikawa H, Tun Z, Young DR, Ozawa H, Yamazaki K, Tanaka E, Honda K. The specific mitochondrial DNA polymorphism found in Klinefelter's syndrome. *Biochem Biophys Res Commun* 2002;**297**:341–5.
- 22 Andrews RM, Kubacka I, Chinnery PF, Lightowlers RN, Turnbull DM, Howell N. Reanalysis and revision of the Cambridge reference sequence for human mitochondrial DNA. *Nat Genet* 1999;**23**:147.
- 23 Monson KL, Miller KW, Wilson MR, DiZinno JA, Budowle B. The mtDNA population database: an integrated software and database resource for forensic comparison. *Forensic Sci Commun* 2002;**4**:2.
- 24 Maruyama S, Minaguchi K, Saitou N. Sequence polymorphisms of the mitochondrial DNA control region and phylogenetic analysis of mtDNA lineages in the Japanese population. *Int J Legal Med* 2003;**117**:218–25.
- 25 Parson W, Parsons TJ, Scheithauer R, Holland MM. Population data for 101 Austrian Caucasian mitochondrial DNA d-loop sequences: application of mtDNA sequence analysis to a forensic case. *Int J Legal Med* 1998;**111**:124–32.
- 26 Bandelt H-J, Quintana-Murci L, Salas A, Macaulay V. The fingerprint of phantom mutations in mitochondrial DNA data. *Am J Hum Genet* 2002;**71**:1150–60.
- 27 Yao Y-G, Bravi CM, Bandelt H-J. A call for mtDNA data quality control in forensic science. *Forensic Sci Int* 2004;**141**:1–6.
- 28 Maitra A, Cohen Y, Gillespie SE, Mambo E, Fukushima N, Hoque MO, Shah N, Goggins M, Califano J, Sidransky D, Chakravarti A. The human MitoChip: a high-throughput sequencing microarray for mitochondrial mutation detection. *Genome Res* 2004;**14**:812–19.
- 29 Ingman M, Kaessmann H, Paabo S, Gyllenstein U. Mitochondrial genome variation and the origin of modern humans. *Nature* 2000;**408**:708–13.
- 30 Bandelt H-J, Alves-Silva J, Guimaraes P, Santos MS, Brehm A, Pereira L, Coppa A, Larruga JM, Rengo C, Scozzari R, Torroni A, Prata MJ, Amorim A, Prado VF, Pena SD. Phylogeography of the human mitochondrial haplogroup L3e: a snapshot of African prehistory and Atlantic slave trade. *Ann Hum Genet* 2001;**65**:549–63.
- 31 Herrnstadt C, Elson JL, Fahy E, Preston G, Turnbull DM, Anderson C, Ghosh SS, Olefsky JM, Beal MF, Davis RE, Howell N. Reduced-median-network analysis of complete mitochondrial DNA coding-region sequences for the major African, Asian, and European haplogroups. *Am J Hum Genet* 2003;**70**:1152–71. Correction, **71**:448–9.
- 32 Shin MG, Kajigaya S, Tarnowka M, McCoy JP, Levin BC, Young NS. Mitochondrial DNA sequence heterogeneity in circulating normal human CD34 cells and granulocytes. *Blood* 2004b;**103**:4466–77.
- 33 Comas D, Plaza S, Wells RS, Yuldaseva N, Lao O, Calafell F, Bertranpetit J. Admixture, migrations, and dispersals in Central Asia: evidence from maternal DNA lineages. *Eur J Hum Genet* 2004;**12**:495–504.
- 34 Shin MG, Kajigaya S, McCoy JP, Levin BC, Young NS. Marked mitochondrial DNA sequence heterogeneity in single CD34+ cell clones from normal adult bone marrow. *Blood* 2004a;**103**:553–61.
- 35 Abnet CC, Huppi K, Carrera A, Armistead D, McKenney K, Hu N, Tang ZZ, Taylor PR, Dawsey SM. Control region mutations and the “common deletion” are frequent in the mitochondrial DNA of patients with esophageal squamous cell carcinoma. *BMC Cancer* 2004;**4**:30.
- 36 Bandelt H-J, Salas A, Lutz-Bonengel S. Artificial recombination in forensic mtDNA population databases. *Int J Legal Med* 2004b;**118**:267–73.
- 37 Bandelt H-J, Salas A, Bravi C. Problems in FBI mtDNA database. *Science* 2004;**305**:1401–4.
- 38 Budowle B, Polanskey D, Allard MW, Chakraborty R. Addressing the use of phylogenetics for identification of sequences in error in the SWGDAM mitochondrial DNA database. *J Forensic Sci* 2004;**49**:1–6.
- 39 Polanskey D, Budowle B. Summary of the findings of a quality review of the Scientific Working Group on DNA analysis methods mitochondrial DNA database. *Forensic Sci Commun* 2005;**7**:1.
- 40 Bandelt H-J, Parson W. Fehlerquellen mitochondrialer DNA-Datensätze und Evaluation der mtDNA-Datenbank “D-Loop-BASE”. *Rechtsmedizin* 2004;**14**:251–7.
- 41 Poetsch M, Wittig H, Krause D, Lignitz E. Corrigendum to “Mitochondrial diversity of a northeast German population sample”. *Forensic Sci Int* 2004;**145**:73–7.
- 42 Coble MD, Just RS, O'Callaghan JE, Letmanyi IH, Peterson CT, Irwin JA, Parsons TJ. Single nucleotide polymorphisms over the entire mtDNA genome that increase the power of forensic testing in Caucasians. *Int J Legal Med* 2004;**118**:137–46.
- 43 Yao Y-G, Macaulay V, Kivisild T, Zhang Y-P, Bandelt H-J. To trust or not to trust an idiosyncratic mitochondrial data set. *Am J Hum Genet* 2003;**72**:1341–6.
- 44 Bandelt H-J, Achilli A, Kong Q-P, Salas A, Lutz-Bonengel S, Sun C, Zhang Y-P, Torroni A, Yao Y-G. Low “penetrance” of phylogenetic knowledge in mitochondrial disease studies. *Biochem Biophys Res Commun* 2005;**331**:1301–9.
- 45 Ladoukakis ED, Eyre-Walker A. Direct evidence of recombination in human mitochondrial DNA. *Heredity* 2004;**93**:321.
- 46 Wallis GP. Do animal mitochondrial genomes recombine? *Trends Ecol Evol* 1999;**14**:209–10.
- 47 Cooper AR, Poinar H. Ancient DNA: do it right or not at all. *Science* 2000;**289**:1139.
- 48 Schwartz M, Vissing J. New patterns of inheritance in mitochondrial disease: *Biochem Biophys Res Commun* 2003;**310**:247–51.
- 49 Bandelt H-J, Yao Y-G, Kivisild T. Mitochondrial genes and schizophrenia. *Schizophr Res* 2005;**72**:267–9.